

# **2009 Health Plan Consumer Satisfaction Report for Utah Commercial HMOs, PPOs, and Medicaid & CHIP Health Plans**

**Utah Department of Health  
Utah Health Data Committee and the Division of Health Care Financing  
November 2009**

Since 1994, the mission of the Utah Health Data Committee has been “to support health improvement initiatives through the collection, analysis, and public release of health care information.” Part of that mission includes reporting on various Health Maintenance Organizations (HMOs) Preferred Provider Organizations (PPOs) and Managed Care Organizations (MCOs). The 2009 Performance Report for Utah Commercial HMOs, PPOs, Medicaid, and CHIP Health Plans is the 13th such report presented by the Utah Health Data Committee.

This report contains information on four commercial HMOs, seven PPOs, two Medicaid HMOs, two Medicaid health plans (Select Access Preferred Provider Network and the fee for service plan), and two Children’s Health Insurance Program (CHIP) HMOs. The four commercial HMOs included in this report represent only a portion of the commercial health plan options that are available in Utah. Only specifically-defined HMOs are required to submit data for this report. However, the four Medicaid health plans and two CHIP HMOs reported here represent all of the coverage options for these populations in Utah. This report contains two types of data, one being quality of care, the second being satisfaction with care.

Data in this report come from the 2009 Consumer Assessment of Health Plans Survey (CAHPS®). This survey year only included responses given adults enrolled in the health plans. This section compares PPOs along with Medicaid, Commercial, and CHIP HMOs.

The goal of this report is to provide information for consumers, purchasers and insurance plans about the performance of Utah’s PPOs, Commercial HMOs, Medicaid HMOs, CHIP HMOs, and Medicaid health plans. Consumers and those who purchase health care can use the information to help them make decisions about which plan to choose. Health plans can use the information to assist them in improving the care and services they provide to enrollees. About 70% of Utahns who currently have health insurance are covered by one of the health plans in this report.

Many different groups contributed to the data collection, analysis, and writing of this report. These include groups within the Utah Department of Health -- Division of Health Care Financing, Division of Community and Family Health Services, the Utah Health Data Committee -- as well as representatives of the participating HMOs.

# Participating HMOs

## Medicaid HMOs:

**Healthy U:** <http://www.uhealthplan.utah.edu/>

**IHC Preferred Provider Network:** <http://intermountainhealthcare.org>

**Molina:** <http://www.molinahealthcare.com/>

## CHIP HMOs:

**Molina:** <http://www.molinahealthcare.com/>

**PEHP:** <http://www.pehp.org/>

## Commercial HMOs:

**Altius Health Plans:** <http://www.altiushealthplans.com/>

**Regence HealthWise:** <http://www.ut.regence.com>

**Select Health:** <http://intermountainhealthcare.org>

**United HealthCare:** <http://www.uhc.com/>

## Commercial PPOs:

**Cigna:** [www.cigna.com](http://www.cigna.com)

**PEHP Preferred:** [www.pehp.org](http://www.pehp.org)

**Regence BlueCross BlueShield of Utah:** [www.ut.regence.com](http://www.ut.regence.com)

**United HealthCare:** [www.uhc.com](http://www.uhc.com)

**Aetna:** [www.aetna.com](http://www.aetna.com)

**Deseret Mutual Benefit Administrators:** [www.dmba.com](http://www.dmba.com)

# *Key Findings*

## **Commercial HMOs are:**

- below national averages for the ratings of health plan, health care, and specialists, getting needed care and claims processing.
- above national averages for the rating of physicians, getting care quickly, physician communication, and customer service experience

## **Medicaid Health Plans are:**

- below national averages for the ratings of health plan, and customer service experience.
- above national averages for the rating of physicians, health care, specialist, getting care quickly, physician communication, and getting needed care.

## **CHIP is:**

- above national averages for all of the ratings.

## **PPOs are:**

- below national averages for the ratings of health plan, physicians, health care, specialists, getting care quickly, getting needed care, and claims processing.
- above national averages for the rating of physician communication, and customer service experience.

# Consumer Satisfaction

This section presents measures from the **Consumer Assessment of Health Plans Survey (CAHPS)**. The survey measured what enrollees thought about the health care and services they received from their health plan in the past year. Issues covered by the questionnaire include whether the enrollee had a problem getting care when he or she needed it, how well their customer service needs were met, as well as how ratings of their health plan, personal physician, specialists, and their health care.

## Data

### Commercial HMOs

<b>COMMERCIAL HMO Adults 2009</b>						
	Altius	HealthWise	SelectHealth	United	State Average	<b>National Average</b>
Rating of Health Plan (% 8, 9, or 10)	61.84%	60.63%	61.78%	46.17%	57.61%	<b>63.89%</b>
Rating of Health Care (% 8, 9, or 10)	75.14%	79.73%	71.66%	72.23%	74.69%	<b>75.87%</b>
Rating of Personal Physician (% 8, 9, or 10)	84.38%	83.41%	79.41%	84.32%	82.88%	<b>82.04%</b>
Rating of Specialist (% 8, 9, or 10)	79.53%	83.64%	72.92%	75.44%	77.88%	<b>81.47%</b>
Getting Care Quickly (% U or A)	84.77%	89.69%	86.06%	88.95%	87.37%	<b>86.99%</b>
How Well Doctors Communicate (% U or A)	94.38%	94.49%	92.07%	95.73%	94.17%	<b>93.50%</b>
Getting Needed Care (% U or A)	83.52%	85.57%	83.78%	83.64%	84.13%	<b>85.88%</b>
Customer Service (% U or A)	85.41%	84.84%	91.94%	77.73%	84.98%	<b>83.99%</b>
Claims Processing (% U or A)	86.93%	86.30%	90.95%	86.72%	87.73%	<b>87.96%</b>

## *Mediciad HMOs*

<b>MEDICAID HMO Adults 2009</b>						
	Molina	SelectHealth	FFS	Healthy U	State Average	<b>National Average</b>
Rating of Health Plan (% 8, 9, or 10)	72.96%	70.20%	66.67%	75.27%	71.28%	<b>72.68%</b>
Rating of Health Care (% 8, 9, or 10)	70.24%	70.08%	68.39%	71.66%	70.09%	<b>68.09%</b>
Rating of Personal Physician (% 8, 9, or 10)	79.95%	78.08%	78.68%	81.72%	79.61%	<b>76.11%</b>
Rating of Specialist (% 8, 9, or 10)	75.34%	78.77%	78.05%	76.73%	77.22%	<b>76.31%</b>
Getting Care Quickly (% U or A)	83.88%	85.22%	84.65%	80.98%	83.68%	<b>80.07%</b>
How Well Doctors Communicate (% U or A)	90.64%	88.49%	90.43%	90.39%	89.99%	<b>87.17%</b>
Getting Needed Care (% U or A)	80.01%	78.40%	80.41%	82.14%	80.24%	<b>75.58%</b>
Customer Service (% U or A)	78.63%	77.04%	79.71%	74.83%	77.55%	<b>80.04%</b>

## *CHIP*

### **CHIP Children 2009**

	Molina	PEHP	CHIP Average	<b>National Average</b>
Rating of Health Plan (% 8, 9, or 10)	76.64%	82.75%	79.70%	<b>72.68%</b>
Rating of Health Care (% 8, 9, or 10)	83.24%	86.06%	84.65%	<b>68.09%</b>
Rating of Personal Physician (% 8, 9, or 10)	89.86%	89.85%	89.86%	<b>76.11%</b>
Rating of Specialist (% 8, 9, or 10)	90.91%	82.17%	86.54%	<b>76.31%</b>
Getting Care Quickly (% U or A)	85.35%	92.38%	88.87%	<b>80.07%</b>
How Well Doctors Communicate (% U or A)	93.53%	95.60%	94.57%	<b>87.17%</b>
Getting Needed Care (% U or A)	85.17%	86.94%	86.06%	<b>75.58%</b>
Customer Service (% U or A)	83.19%	83.22%	83.21%	<b>80.04%</b>

## *Commercial PPOs*

<b>Commercial PPO Adults 2009</b>								
	Aetna	Cigna	Deseret	PEHP	Regence	United	State Average	<b>National Average</b>
Rating of Health Plan (% 8, 9, or 10)	46.52%	51.67%	79.24%	61.70%	57.82%	48.87%	57.64%	<b>57.72%</b>
Rating of Health Care (% 8, 9, or 10)	74.83%	69.39%	77.34%	76.45%	70.91%	66.11%	72.51%	<b>74.99%</b>
Rating of Personal Physician (% 8, 9, or 10)	76.34%	76.65%	81.55%	83.92%	78.74%	77.08%	79.05%	<b>81.95%</b>
Rating of Specialist (% 8, 9, or 10)	79.47%	80.42%	78.74%	79.13%	75.00%	79.19%	78.66%	<b>81.01%</b>
Getting Care Quickly (% U or A)	84.66%	86.26%	89.13%	82.48%	83.60%	84.73%	85.14%	<b>87.17%</b>
Doctor's Communication(% U or A)	91.89%	91.40%	93.97%	96.36%	94.23%	95.70%	93.93%	<b>87.17%</b>
Getting Needed Care (% U or A)	83.60%	84.64%	86.44%	82.90%	82.20%	83.61%	83.90%	<b>86.45%</b>
Customer Service (% U or A)	83.94%	78.97%	90.58%	81.61%	90.62%	74.82%	83.42%	<b>82.57%</b>
Claims Processing (% U or A)	79.74%	83.66%	90.29%	84.06%	88.61%	80.95%	84.55%	<b>86.91%</b>

# *LINKS*

Information about the way the data for this report was obtained:

- For CAHPS (AHRQ):
  - <https://www.cahps.ahrq.gov/default.asp>

Information about general health:

- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
  - <http://www.cdc.gov>
- Check Your Health
  - <http://www.checkyourhealth.org>
- MyHealthCare in Utah
  - <http://www.health.utah.gov/myhealthcare>

Information about the heart and lungs:

- American Heart Association
  - <http://www.americanheart.org>
- American Lung Association
  - <http://www.lungusa.org>

Information about reproductive health and maternity:

- Utah Department of Health, Reproductive Health Program
  - <http://health.utah.gov/rhp/>

Information about diabetes:

- American Diabetes Association
  - <http://www.diabetes.org>

# *Acknowledgments*

## **Utah Department of Health**

Internet: <http://health.utah.gov>

### **Executive Director's Office**

David N. Sundwall Executive Director

A. Richard Melton Deputy Director

W. David Patton Deputy Director

Barry E. Nangle Director, Center for Health Data

### **Division of Health Care Financing**

Michael Hales Division Director

Nathan Checketts Assistant Division Director

Emma Chacon Bureau of Managed Health Care Director

Gail Rapp Bureau of Managed Health Care Director

Barbara Christensen Health Program Manager

Wanda Gutierrez Quality Improvement Specialist

Heidi Weaver CHIP Program Manager

Jeff Nelson PCN Program Manager

### **Division of Community and Family Health Services**

George Delavan Division Director

LaDene Larsen Bureau Director

Nan Streeter Bureau Director

Richard Bullough Manager, Diabetes Program

### **Office of Health Care Statistics**

Keely Cofrin Allen Director

Mark Gaskill APD Program Manager

Lori Brady Web Developer

Becca Finlayson Support Services Coordinator

Mike Martin Research Consultant

Carol Masheter Epidemiologist

John Morgan Business Analyst Supervisor

Sam Vanous\* HMO Health Program Manager

### **Utah Health Data Committee (UHDC)**

Internet: <http://health.utah.gov/hda>

Robert P. Huefner Public Health Representative (Chair)

Greg Poulsen Hospital Representative (Vice-Chair)

Kim Bateman Physicians Representative

Bill Crim Consumer Advocacy Representative

David Call Third Party Payer Representative

Douglas Hasbrouck HMO Representative

Leslie Francis Public Health Representative

Terry Haven Consumer Advocacy Representative

Stephen Kroes Small Business Representative

Kevin Martin Nursing Representative

Gary Nordhoff Public Interest Representative

Jim Wall Business Representative

\* This report was developed and written by Sam Vanous, Ph.D., formatted by Lori Brady, and was reviewed by participating Health Plans, members of the Utah Health Data Committee, Office of Health Care Statistics staff, the Utah Department of Health's Executive Director's Office, and many other individuals in the Utah Department of Health.

**Special thanks** to Altius Health Plans, Cigna, Deseret Mutual, Aetna, Healthy U, SelectHealth, Molina HealthCare of Utah, Public Employees Health Program, HealthWise, United Healthcare, and the Division of Health Care Financing for their support and participation in this project.

Thanks to DataStat, Inc. for conducting the consumer satisfaction surveys and assisting with data analysis.

Thanks also to the staff at Westat for providing additional analysis of the national averages for this report.

*The source for national data contained in this publication is Quality Compass® and is used with the permission of the National Committee for Quality Assurance (NCQA). Any analysis, interpretation, or conclusion based on these data is solely that of the authors, and NCQA specifically disclaims responsibility for any such analysis, interpretation, or conclusion. Quality Compass is a registered trademark of NCQA.*

*CAHPS® is a registered trademark of the Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality (AHRQ).*

For more information about this and other health care reports, contact the Office of Health Care Statistics at (801) 538-7048.